Volume 2: Cost of Capital: Expert Opinion of James Coyne-Return on Equity

Q. With respect to the stand-alone principle (page 8), is the requirement for just and reasonable rates satisfied if the parent of Newfoundland Power (Fortis) requires Newfoundland Power to borrow under its own name rather than the policy of ATCO subsidiaries in Alberta borrowing at the parent level and mirroring the costs down to its regulated subsidiaries? That is, if the parent imposes on its regulated "stand-alone" subsidiary policies that result in higher costs does that satisfy the legal requirement that rates be fair and reasonable even if they are the utility's actual costs?

A. Concentric is not able to offer a legal opinion. Concentric has a different understanding of ATCO's borrowing. Concentric's understanding is that debt is issued by Canadian Utilities Ltd. and CU Inc. for its regulated utilities, and not at the parent level. Regulators are governed by the legal requirement to provide a fair return that reflects the risk profile of the utility for which the return is being set. If the parent company is able to borrow on a more favorable basis and pass that benefit along to its subsidiary, a regulator may consider that in the public interest, but the question is not that simple, as the regulator may also find ring-fencing provisions which separate the assets and liabilities of the subsidiary from the parent to also be in the public interest.

In addition, as discussed on page 8 of Concentric's report, the stand-alone principle requires that the utility must be regulated as if it were a stand-alone entity, raising capital on the merits of its own business and financial characteristics. In this way, capital may be efficiently allocated, with each business segment earning a return based on its own unique set of risks and business characteristics regardless of affiliations within the holding company structure.

The Board has upheld the stand-alone principle and concluded that, in the interest of both customers and the utility, Newfoundland Power should be treated as a stand-alone utility.